

Valletta, 28 June 2022



PEJ(2022)6

## EUROPEAN COMMISSION FOR THE EFFICIENCY OF JUSTICE

(CEPEJ)

38<sup>th</sup> plenary meeting

27 and 28 June 2022

(Valletta, Malta)

Abridged report

### FOREWORD

The European Commission for the Efficiency of Justice (CEPEJ) of the Council of Europe held its 38<sup>th</sup> plenary meeting in Valletta (Malta) on 27 and 28 June 2022. The meeting was chaired by Mr. Ramin GARAGURBANLI (Azerbaijan), President of the CEPEJ.

In the framework of the plenary meeting, a ceremony celebrating the 20<sup>th</sup> anniversary of the CEPEJ was organised. It was opened by a pre-recorded address by the Secretary General of the Council of Europe, Ms Marija Pejčinović Burić, and by the Minister of Justice of Malta, Mr. Jonathan Attard, and followed by a thematic discussion on the challenges, in terms of quality and efficiency, of a digitalised justice.

The plenary meeting was held in Malta at the invitation of the Ministry of Justice of Malta and the Maltese member and Vice-President of the CEPEJ. The Head of the Department “Implementation of human rights standards, justice and legal co-operation”, Mr. Frédéric DOLT, thanked the Maltese organization and recalled the challenges and the main works to be examined during this meeting.

The agenda and the list of participants appear as appendices.

### LIST OF ITEMS DISCUSSED AND DECISIONS TAKEN BY THE CEPEJ

The CEPEJ:

**warmly thanked** the Maltese authorities and Mr. Francesco DEPASQUALE (Malta), Vice-President of the CEPEJ, for their invitation to hold the 38<sup>th</sup> plenary meeting and the ceremony celebrating the 20<sup>th</sup> anniversary of the CEPEJ in Valletta.

#### 1. Recent developments in the field of justice in the Member and Observer States

**took note** of the information provided by delegations of Azerbaijan, Croatia, Greece, Italy, the Republic of Moldova, Kazakhstan and Japan on some significant developments in their countries since December 2021.

#### 2. Quality of justice, cyberjustice and artificial intelligence

**took note** of the progress in the implementation of the “Revised Roadmap for ensuring an appropriate follow-up of the CEPEJ Ethical Charter on the use of artificial intelligence in judicial systems and their environment”[1] and in particular of the constitution of the CEPEJ Advisory Bureau on Artificial Intelligence (AIAB), of its composition and of the development of the Resource Centre on Cyber justice and Artificial Intelligence (AI);

**invited** its Working Groups on Quality of Justice (CEPEJ-GT-QUAL) and on cyberjustice and AI (CEPEJ-GT-CYBERJUST) to continue its work in this field, in good coordination and by calling henceforth on the expertise of the

AIAB, **recalled** on this occasion that as regards AI, the CEPEJ-GT-QUAL is competent for the follow-up of the CEPEJ Charter on AI, the CEPEJ-GT-CYBERJUST being in charge of the other activities concerning AI;

**took note** of the ongoing work within the CEPEJ-GT-QUAL, on administrative mediation in Council of Europe member states, gender equality in the recruitment and promotion of judges, access to justice for people with disabilities and the evaluation of judges;

**took note** of the ongoing work in the CEPEJ-GT-CYBERJUST on the revision of the ICT index developed in the framework of the evaluation process of judicial systems and implemented under the authority of the Working Group on Evaluation (CEPEJ-GT-EVAL), on the electronic auctions, on the public case law databases and on online alternative dispute resolution;

**took note** of the activities of the European Cyberjustice Network, with already 43 members, and of the organisation of its 2<sup>nd</sup> meeting on 21 November 2022 by videoconference, **invited** the Member States to make the best use of it and **encouraged** those who have not yet designated members of the network to do so before the 2<sup>nd</sup> meeting.

### 3. Judicial time management

**took note** of the ongoing work in the Working Group on judicial time management (CEPEJ-SATURN) concerning a possible tool to better detect delays in civil proceedings, the implementation of a case weighting system within the prosecution service, the possible revision of the Time Management Checklist[2] as well as the preparation of a proposal to be submitted to the European Committee on Legal Co-operation (CDCJ) to update the Recommendation No. R(86)12 of the Committee of Ministers on measures to prevent and reduce excessive workload in the courts;

**took note** of the holding of an *ad hoc* meeting of the Pilot Courts Network by videoconference on 4 May 2022 during which the draft questionnaire on the detection of delays in civil proceedings was discussed, **took note** of the organization of the 15<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Pilot Courts Network in Strasbourg on 13 October 2022 and **invited** its members to contribute to the updating of the list of pilot courts by checking their motivation to participate in the Network.

### 4. Evaluation of judicial systems

**thanked** the national correspondents for their involvement in the collection and quality control of the data and **instructed** its members to inform them of the content of the Evaluation Report as presented during the meeting;

**adopted** the CEPEJ Evaluation Report - European Judicial Systems, 2022 evaluation cycle (2020 data), subject to additional comments indicated in writing by delegations to the Secretariat, through the form provided for this purpose, before 12 July 2022 and taking into account the discussions at the present meeting, **agreed** that no new data will be accepted after this date and **instructed** the Secretariat to organize the publication and dissemination of the report in an appropriate manner starting on 5 October 2022;

**took note** that specific studies based on the CEPEJ 2020 data will be prepared by the justice professionals enjoying observer status with the CEPEJ (Council of the Notaries of the European Union, International Union of Judicial Officers, European Expertise & Expert Institute) and submitted to the CEPEJ-GT-EVAL before their publication on the CEPEJ-STAT page;

**entrusted** the CEPEJ-GT-EVAL with the preparation of the next evaluation cycle 2024, based on the 2022 data;

**encouraged** delegations to contact the Secretariat with a view to organising peer reviews to support the collection and quality control of data for the next cycle;

**welcomed** the continued cooperation with the European Commission, on the basis of the CEPEJ's own evaluation methodology, on: (i) an annual study on the functioning of the judicial systems in the EU member states; (ii) the annual evaluation of the functioning of the judicial systems in the beneficiaries of the Western Balkans (Albania, Bosnia and Herzegovina, Kosovo\*, Northern Macedonia, Montenegro and Serbia); (iii) the annual evaluation of the functioning of judicial systems in the "Eastern Partnership" countries (Armenia, Azerbaijan, Georgia, Republic of Moldova, Ukraine), and **entrusted** the CEPEJ-GT-EVAL with the task of continuing this co-operation, which reinforces the pre-eminent role of the CEPEJ in the field of evaluation of justice, as well as the synergies between the European Union and the Council of Europe in this field.

## 5. CEPEJ co-operation programmes

**took note** of the ongoing activities, achievements and next steps in the cooperation programmes presented by the beneficiaries' representatives (Azerbaijan, Kosovo\*, Republic of Moldova, Morocco, Spain, and Egypt) and of the remaining projects presented in the synthesis document[3] (Albania, Georgia, Latvia, Tunisia, South Programme IV);

**welcomed** the *ad hoc* cooperation to be organised with the Supreme Court of Ukraine to assist the Ukrainian judiciary in implementing remote court hearings in line with European standards through legislative expertise on a draft law and the preparation of a Practical Guide for Ukrainian legal professionals, and **agreed** to identify experts in the field of online hearings, civil and criminal proceedings and wartime legislation that could be made available as soon as possible to provide this support and to forward their names to the Secretariat as soon as possible.

## 6. CEPEJ Action Plan 2022 – 2025: “Digitalisation for better justice” - Exchange of views on concrete ways of implementing the Action Plan

**welcomed** the developments in the implementation of the Action Plan since its adoption in December 2021 and **invited its members** to suggest, according to their needs, concrete activities falling within the framework of this Action Plan, with a view to drawing up the draft programme of activities for 2023-2024 to be adopted at the 39<sup>th</sup> plenary meeting next December.

## 7. CEPEJ 2021 Activity report

**adopted** its 2021 Activity Report[4].

## 8. Junior Crystal Scales of Justice Prize

**took note** of the results of the second edition of the Junior Crystal Scales of Justice Prize organised in partnership with the Faculty of Law of Strasbourg, **congratulated** the winning team from the Faculty of Law of the University of Pisa, led by Mrs. Favaro, who defended the French winning project of the Crystal Scales of Justice 2021, as well as the Pisa team supervised by Mr. Borgia, who defended the Danish project and to whom a special mention was awarded, **agreed** to invite the winning team to present their project at the next CEPEJ plenary meeting to be held in December 2022;

**thanked** the President of the Jury and its members for their valuable commitment and the added value of their analysis.

## 9. European Day of Justice 2021

**invited** its members to promote initiatives for the 2022 edition of the “European Day of Justice” to be celebrated on 25 October and to send to the Secretariat the programmes of events for publication on the CEPEJ website.

## 10. HELP Training Program concerning CEPEJ

**took note** of the latest progress in the preparation, via the HELP[5] platform, of an online training course on the theme of the quality of justice and of the work of the CEPEJ, which will include different modules in the fields of quality of justice, evaluation of judicial systems, cyberjustice and AI, mediation and of judicial time management.

## 11. Other items

**took note** of the presentation of the project “Court App” by Ms Natalie Réa, President of the NGO Court-Access Project, aimed to improve communication between police, prosecutors and courts, to ensure that the legal timeframe between arrest and first appearance before a magistrate is respected and to reduce unlawful early pretrial detention, and **invited its members** to contact the Secretariat in case of interest in national use;

**took note** that the 39<sup>th</sup> plenary meeting of the CEPEJ should take place on 6 and 7 December 2022, and that all the dates of the other CEPEJ meetings are indicated on the CEPEJ website.

27 June 2022

9.00 AM – 1.30 PM ANNIVERSARY CEREMONY (see separate agenda)

1.30 PM – 3.00 PM LUNCH


### 38<sup>TH</sup> PLENARY MEETING

27 and 28 June 2022

*Please note that the order of business can be different than the order of the items in the agenda. It will be decided at the beginning of the meeting.*

27 June 2022 (3.00 pm – 6.00 pm)		
1.	<b>Opening of the meeting</b> <b>Frédéric Dolt</b> <i>Head of the Department for the Implementation of Human Rights, Justice and Legal Co-operation Standards, Directorate of Human Rights, Directorate General I – Human Rights and Rule of Law</i>	
2.	<b>Adoption of the agenda and information from the President and from the Secretariat</b>	
3.	<b>Recent developments in the field of justice in member and observer States</b> <i>(Delegations are invited to inform the CEPEJ, of significant developments in their country since December 2021 - Interventions limited to 3 minutes)</i>	Delegations already announced:  - <b>Kazakhstan</b> Shakir SHAYAKHMETOV, Head of the Department for ensuring the activities of courts at Supreme Court of the Republic of Kazakhstan "Issues of digitization of the justice system"  - <b>Japan</b> Hikaru IWAKI, Consul (Attorney), Consulate-General of Japan in Strasbourg
4.	<b>Developments in cyberjustice and artificial intelligence (AI) (joint work of the CEPEJ-GT-QUAL and the CEPEJ-GT-CYBERJUST)</b>	<b><u>Working documents</u></b>  AIAB terms of reference  CEPEJ-GT-QUAL(2022)3Rev1  List of AIAB members  CEPEJ-GT-QUAL(2022)6  <b><u>Reference document</u></b>  Revised roadmap for ensuring an appropriate follow-up of the European Ethical Charter on the use of artificial intelligence in judicial systems and their environment
a.	Setting up of the CEPEJ Artificial Intelligence Advisory Board (AIAB)  <i>Summary of work: Joao Arsenio De Oliveira, President of the CEPEJ-GT-QUAL</i>	
b.	Development of the Resource Centre on Cyberjustice and AI  <i>Summary of work : Giuliana Civinini, President of the CEPEJ-GT-CYBERJUST</i>	

		CEPEJ(2021)16
5.	<b>Other work on quality of justice</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Administrative mediation in Council of Europe member States</li> <li>b. Gender equality in the recruitment and promotion of judges</li> <li>c. Access to justice for people with disabilities</li> <li>d. Evaluation of judges</li> </ul>	<b><u>Reference document</u></b>  Meeting report of 32 <sup>nd</sup> meeting of the CEPEJ-GT-QUAL  CEPEJ-GT-QUAL(2022)5
6.	<b>Other work on cyberjustice and artificial intelligence</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. European Cyberjustice Network</li> <li>b. Revision ICT-Index</li> <li>c. E-auctions</li> <li>d. Public Case law databases</li> <li>e. Online ADR</li> </ul>	<b><u>Reference document</u></b>  Meeting report of 6 <sup>th</sup> meeting of the CEPEJ-GT-CYBERJUST and of the joint meeting of the CEPEJ-GT-QUAL and of the CEPEJ-GT-CYBERJUST  CEPEJ-GT-CYBERJUST(2022)5REV
7.	<b>Judicial time management</b> <i>Summary of work: Giacomo Oberto, President of the CEPEJ-SATURN</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Tool to better detect delays in civil proceedings</li> <li>b. Implementation of a system of case-weighting in the public prosecution services</li> <li>c. Time Management Checklist</li> <li>d. Possible update of the Recommendation No. R(86)12 on measures to prevent and reduce the excessive workload in the courts</li> <li>e. Network of the CEPEJ pilot courts <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- The CEPEJ pilot courts and the health crisis</li> <li>- Meetings of the Network</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	<b><u>Reference documents</u></b>  Questionnaire on detecting delays in civil proceedings  CEPEJ-SATURN(2021)11rev  Questionnaire on case weighting in public prosecution services  CEPEJ-SATURN(2022)3  Case weighting in judicial systems  CEPEJ Studies No. 28  Recommendation No. R(86)12  Agenda of the meeting of pilot courts (4 May 2022)  CEPEJ-Pilot Courts(2022)OJ1  Analytical report on the experiences of pilot courts with judicial time management in times of health crisis  CEPEJ-SATURN(2022)1  <i>Ad hoc</i> CEPEJ SATURN meeting report  CEPEJ-SATURN(2022)2  32 <sup>nd</sup> CEPEJ SATURN meeting report  CEPEJ-SATURN(2022)6

8.	<b>CEPEJ Cooperation programmes</b> <i>Presentation: Clémence Bouquemont</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Cooperation with Ukraine</li> </ul>	<u><b>Reference document</b></u>  CEPEJ Cooperation programmes - state of implementation  CEPEJ-COOP(2022)1
<b>28 June 2022 (9.00 am – 2.00 pm)</b>		
9.	<b>Evaluation of judicial systems</b> <i>Summary of work: Jaša Vrabec, President of the CEPEJ-GT-EVAL</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. 2022 evaluation report - European judicial systems, 2022 cycle (2020 data)</li> <li>b. Cooperation with EU <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- European Union Justice Scoreboard</li> <li>- Dashboard Western Balkans</li> <li>- Justice Dashboard EaP</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	<u><b>Working documents</b></u>   European judicial systems - CEPEJ  Evaluation Report - Evaluation cycle 2022 (2020 data)  Part 1: Tables, graphs and analysis  CEPEJ-GT-EVAL(2022)12  Part 2: Country Profiles  CEPEJ-GT-EVAL(2022)13  <u><b>Reference documents</b></u>  Evaluation scheme  Explanatory note  Study of the functioning of judicial systems in the EU member states  CEPEJ(2021)18rev1 part 1  CEPEJ(2021)18rev1 part 2  EU Justice Scoreboard  Meeting report of the 42 <sup>nd</sup> meeting of the CEPEJ-GT-EVAL  CEPEJ-GT-EVAL(2022)1
10.	<b>2022-2025 CEPEJ Action Plan : "Digitalisation for a better justice" - Exchange of views on concrete ways of implementing the Action Plan</b>	<u><b>Reference document</b></u>  2022-2025 CEPEJ Action Plan : "Digitalisation for a better justice".  CEPEJ(2021)12
11	<b>2021 CEPEJ activity report</b>	<u><b>Working document</b></u>

		☐ CEPEJ(2022)5
12.	<b>Junior Crystal Scales of justice</b> <i>Presentation: Christel Schurrer</i>	
13.	<b>European Day of Justice 2022</b>	<b><u>Reference document</u></b>  Report on the events organised in the framework of the celebration of the 2021 European day of Justice  CEPEJ(2021)14
14.	<b>HELP course concerning CEPEJ</b> (European Programme for Human Rights Education for Legal Professionals)	
15.	<b>Other items</b> - Presentation of the “Court App” by Mrs Natalie Rea, President of the “Court-Access Project” - Draft calendar of 2022 meetings - Date and place of the next meeting	<b><u>Reference document</u></b>  2022 Meetings Calendar

## Annex II : List of participants

### Public list of participants / Liste de participants publique

#### CEPEJ MEMBERS / MEMBRES DE LA CEPEJ

ALBANIA/ALBANIE

**NOT CONFIRMED**

ANDORRA/ANDORRE

**Marta TORRES DUEDRA**, Secretària General del Consell Superior de la Justícia, AD 500 ANDORRA LA VELLA PRINCIPAT D'ANDORRA (online)

ARMENIA/ARMENIE

**NOT CONFIRMED**

AUSTRIA/AUTRICHE

**Georg STAWA**, Counsellor for Southeast Europe, Federal Ministry of Justice, Austrian Embassy, BELGRADE

AZERBAIJAN/AZERBAÏDJAN

**Ramin GARAGURBANLI**, Judge, Criminal Division of the Baku Court of Appeal, Head of the working group on e-Court System, Ministry of Justice, BAKU

**(President of the CEPEJ / Président de la CEPEJ)**

**Mubariz AKBAROV**, President of the Baku Court of Appeal, member of the High Judicial Council of Azerbaijan Republi, BAKU

**Saadet BANANYARLI**, Chairman of the Public Council under the Ministry of Justice, BAKU

BELGIUM/BELGIQUE

**Jean-Paul JANSSENS**, Président du Comité de direction, Service Public Fédéral, Justice, BRUXELLES

BOSNIA AND HERZEGOVINA/*BOSNIE-HERZÉGOVINE*

**Svjetlana MILISIC-VELICKOVSKI**, Judge, Supreme Court, SARAJEVO

BULGARIA/*BULGARIE*

**Vera CHAVDAROVA**, State Expert, International Legal Cooperation and European Affairs Directorate, Ministry of Justice of Republic of Bulgaria, SOFIA

CROATIA/*CROATIE*

**Ivan CRNČEC**, Assistant Minister, International Co-operation Directorate, Ministry of justice, Ulica Grada Vukovara 49, 10 000, ZAGREB

CYPRUS / *CHYPRE*

**Lena DEMETRIADES ANDREOU**, Justice of the Supreme Court, NICOSIA

CZECH REPUBLIC/*REPUBLIQUE TCHEQUE*

**Ivana BORZOVÁ**, Head of Department of Civil Supervision, Ministry of Justice, PRAGUE

DENMARK/*DANEMARK*

**Marianne GRAM NYBROE**, International Coordinator, Department of Training, Danish Court Administration, COPENHAGEN

**Merethe ECKHARDT**, Director, Danish Court Administration, COPENHAGEN

ESTONIA/*ESTONIE*

**Viljar PEEP**, Deputy Secretary General for judicial administration policy, Ministry of Justice, TALLINN

FINLAND/*FINLANDE*

**Kari KIESILAINEN**, Permanent State Under-Secretary, Ministry of Justice, HELSINKI

**Noora AARNIO**, Senior specialist, International Affairs, Department of Development, The National Courts Administration, Silkkitehtaan tie 5C, VANTAA

FRANCE

**Sonya DJEMNI-WAGNER**, Inspectrice générale de la Justice, Ministère de la Justice, PARIS

GEORGIA/*GÉORGIE*

**Nino BAKAKURI**, Judge, Supreme Court, TBILISI

GERMANY / *ALLEMAGNE*

**Bärbel KOHAKE**, Chef adjoint du Service de procédure civile internationale, Ministère fédéral de la justice, BERLIN

**Andreas NEFF**, President of the District Court of Baden Wurttemberg, STUTTGART

**Kathrin LEGNER**, Ministry of Justice and for Migration Baden-Wuerttemberg, STUTTGART (online)

GREECE/*GRÈCE*

**Konstantinos KOUSSOULIS**, Councilor, Hellenic Council of State, ATHENS

HUNGARY/*HONGRIE*



**Judit GYARMATHY**, Judge, Secretary-General of the Curia of Hungary (supreme judicial forum), BUDAPEST

ICELAND/*ISLANDE*

**Kristin HARALDSOTTIR**, Director of the Judicial Administration, Dómsstólasýslan, REYKJAVÍK (online)

IRELAND/*IRLANDE*

**Liam COHEN**, Head of Access to Justice, Regulation and Reform Unit, Department of Justice, DUBLIN

**Stephen MCCARTNEY**, Assistant Principal Officer, Courts Service, Legislation and Rules Unit, Strategy and Reform Directorate, Green Street, DUBLIN 7 (online)

ITALY/*ITALIE*

**Giuliana PALUMBO**, Directeur Général, Direction des statistiques et analyses organisationnelles, Ministère de la Justice, ROME

LATVIA/*LETONIE*

**Aija BRANTA**, Justice of the Criminal Chamber of the Supreme Court, RIGA

**Anna SKRJABINA**, Project leader, Court Administration, RIGA

LIECHTENSTEIN

**NOT CONFIRMED**

LITHUANIA/*LITUANIE*

**Egidija TAMOŠIŪNIENĖ**, Judge of Civil Cases Division, Court of Appeal of Lithuania, VILNIUS

LUXEMBOURG

**Claudine KONSBRUCK**, Conseiller de Gouvernement 1ère classe, Directeur, Délégué du Gouvernement, LUXEMBOURG

**Jeannot NIES**, Procureur Général d'Etat adjoint, Parquet général du Grand-duché de LUXEMBOURG (online)

MALTA/*MALTE*

**Francesco DEPASQUALE**, The Honourable Mr Justice, Superior Courts, Ministry of Justice and Home Affairs, VALETTA

**Joanne BATTISTINO**, Officer, Ministry of Justice, VALETTA  
REPUBLIC OF MOLDOVA / *REPUBLICUE DE MOLDOVA*

**Victoria PALANCIUC**, Trainer for employees of the judiciary, The National Institute of Justice, National Consultant for PNUD, CHISINAU

**Veronica BRADAUTANU**, Advisor to the Minister of Justice, Ministry of Justice, CHISINAU  
MONACO

**Sébastien BIANCHERI**, Conseiller, Secrétaire du Conseil d'Etat, Cour d'Appel, MONACO (online)

MONTENEGRO

**Veljko VUČKOVIĆ**, Directorate for Judiciary Ministry of Justice, Vuka Karadžića 3, 81000, PODGORICA (online)

NETHERLANDS/*PAYS-BAS*

**Eliane EIJNWACHTER**, Ministry of Justice, THE HAGUE

NORTH MACEDONIA / *MACEDOINE DU NORD*

**Nikola PROKOPENKO**, State counselor, Ministry of Justice, SKOPJE  
NORWAY/NORVÈGE

**Iwar ARNSTAD**, Head of International secretariat, The National Courts Administration (online)

POLAND/POLOGNE

**Michał DĄBROWSKI**, Judge, Main expert in the Department of Courts, Organisation and Judicial Analyses, Ministry of Justice, WARSAW

PORTUGAL

**João ARSENIO DE OLIVEIRA**, Head of Department, International Affairs Department, Directorate General for Justice Policy, Ministry of Justice, LISBON

ROMANIA/ROUMANIE

**Violeta BELEGANTE**, Conseiller juridique, Chef du service du droit privé, Direction de l'Elaboration des actes normatifs, des études et de la documentation, Ministère de la Justice, BUCAREST

SAN MARINO/ SAINT-MARIN

**NOT CONFIRMED**

SERBIA/SERBIE

**Jelena DERETIC**, Ministry of Justice, BELGRADE (online)

SLOVAK REPUBLIC/RÉPUBLIQUE SLOVAQUE

**Zuzana SCHURER PIOVARČIOVÁ**, Adviser of the Analytical Unit, Ministry of Justice, BRATISLAVA

SLOVENIA /SLOVENIE

**Gregor STROJIN**, Advisor to the President, Supreme Court, LJUBLJANA

SPAIN/ESPAGNE

**Juan Fernando ARMENGOT IBORRA**, Advisor, Directorate General for international Legal Co-operation and Relations with Religious Affairs, Ministry of Justice, MADRID (online)

SWEDEN/SUÈDE

**Anna WIELGOSZ**, Swedish National Courts Administration, STOCKHOLM (online)

SWITZERLAND/SUISSE

**Jacques BÜHLER**, Secrétaire Général suppléant, Tribunal fédéral suisse, LAUSANNE(online)

TÜRKIYE

**Ayşegül ALAKUŞ**,Rapporteur Judge , Ministry of Justice, ANKARA

**Zuhal TOKAR GÜNEŞ**, Rapporteur Judge, Ministry of Justice, ANKARA

**Zeki UYSAL**, Judge, Council of Judges and Prosecutors, ANKARA (online)

UKRAINE

**Oleksandra YANOVSKA**, judge of the Supreme Court, KIEV

**Sergii KOZIAKOV**, Chairman of the High Qualification Commission of Judges of Ukraine 2014-2019, KIEV

**Alejandro BIONDI**, Strategy Officer, Strategy Unit, Business Strategy Division, Finance, Governance & Performance, HMCTS, Ministry of Justice, 102 Petty France, LONDON SW1H 9AJ (online)

**Ila PATERMANN-CORNICK**, Her Majesty's Courts & Tribunals Service, Ministry of Justice, LONDON (online)

**Ross KERWOOD**, Her Majesty's Courts & Tribunals Service, Ministry of Justice, LONDON (online)

\*\*\*

#### **WORKING GROUPS OF THE CEPEJ / GROUPES DE TRAVAIL DE LA CEPEJ**

**João ARSENIO DE OLIVEIRA**, Head of Department, International Affairs Department, Directorate General for Justice Policy, Ministry of Justice, LISBON, PORTUGAL (Chair of the CEPEJ-GT-QUAL / *Président du CEPEJ-GT-QUAL*)

**Jaša VRABEC**, Head of the Office for Court Management Development, Supreme Court, LJUBLJANA, SLOVENIA (Chair of the CEPEJ-GT-EVAL / *Président du CEPEJ-GT-EVAL*)

**Giacomo OBERTO**, Magistrat, Tribunal de Grande Instance, TURIN, ITALIE (Chair of the CEPEJ-SATURN / *Président du CEPEJ-SATURN*)

**Maria Giuliana CIVININI**, Judge, member of the Italian Judiciary, President of the Tribunal of Pisa, ITALY (Chair of the CEPEJ-CYBERJUST / *Présidente du CEPEJ-CYBERJUST*)

\*\*\*

#### **OBSERVER STATES TO THE CEPEJ / ÉTATS OBSERVATEURS AUPRES DE LA CEPEJ**

GUATEMALA

**Idonaldo AREVAEL FUENTES FUENTES**, General Director, Institute of Criminal Public Defence

**Mayra ALEJANDRA CARRILLO DE LEON**, General Director  
ISRAEL / ISRAËL

**Gali AVIV**, Director of the Israeli Courts Research Division, Supreme Court, JERUSALEM

**Dalia ERENTAL**, Researcher, Israeli Courts Research Division, Supreme Court, JERUSALEM

JAPAN / JAPON

**Hikaru IWAKI**, Consul (Attorney), Consulate-General of Japan in Strasbourg, STRASBOURG

KAZAKHSTAN

**Shakir SHAYAKHMETOV**, Head of the Department of International Relations of the Department for Ensuring the Activities of Courts under the Supreme Court of the Republic of Kazakhstan, NŪR-SŪLTAN

MOROCCO / MAROC

**Samia CHAKRI**, Directrice des études, de la coopération et de la modernisation, Ministère de la justice, RABAT

**Karim HARROUCHE**, Point focal, Ministère de la Justice, RABAT

**Saad GADDAR**, Conseiller au secrétariat général, Ministère de la Justice, RABAT

**Mohamed OUKHLIFA**, Chargé des relations internationales à la Présidence du Ministère Public, RABAT

\*\*\*

#### **INVITED DELEGATIONS IN THE FRAMEWORK OF THE CEPEJ COOPERATION**

## DELEGATIONS INVITEES DANS LE CADRE DE LA COOPERATION CEPEJ

### AZERBAIJAN/AZERBAÏDJAN

**Sanan HAJIYEV**, President of the Civil Chamber of the Supreme Court of Azerbaijan, and a member of Judicial Legal Council of the Republic of Azerbaijan, BAKU

**Aynur SABITOVA**, Director of the General Department for Human Rights and Public Relations of the Ministry of Justice of the Republic of Azerbaijan, BAKU

**Leyla ZAKIROVA**, Group leader at the Organization and Supervision General Department of the Ministry of Justice of Azerbaijan, National Correspondent for the CEPEJ, BAKU (online)

### KOSOVO<sup>[6]</sup>

**Enver FEJZULLAHU**, Executive Director of Kosovo Justice Academy, PRISHTINA

**Albert ZOGAJ**, Chairman of the Kosovo Judicial Council, PRISHTINA

\*\*\*

## SPEAKERS AT THE CEREMONY / INTERVENANTS A LA CEREMONIE

**Oonagh BUCKLEY**, Deputy Secretary General, Department of Justice of Ireland, Representative of the Irish Presidency of the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe

**Christian MEUWLY**, Ambassador, Permanent Representative of Switzerland, Chair of the Rapporteur Group-Legal Cooperation of the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe

**Xavier RONSIN**, First President of the Appeal Court of Rennes (France), CEPEJ Expert

**Veronica MIHAILOV-MORARU**, Secretary of State, Ministry of Justice of the Republic of Moldova

**Damijan FLORJANČIČ**, President of the Supreme Court of Slovenia

**Antonio VERCHER NOGUERA**, President of the Consultative Council of European Prosecutors of the Council of Europe (CCPE)

**Thomas SCHNEIDER**, Ambassador of Switzerland, President of the Committee on Artificial Intelligence of the Council of Europe (CAI) (online)

**Jānis BORDĀNS**, Deputy Prime Minister and Minister of Justice of Latvia

**Samia CHAKRI**, Directrice des études, de la coopération et de la modernisation, Ministère de la justice, Rabat, MAROC

**Duro SESSA**, President of the European Association of Judges and former President of the Consultative Council of European Judges of the Council of Europe (CCJE)

**Joseph CANNATACI**, Professor, Head of the Department of Information Policy & Governance, Faculty of Media & Knowledge Sciences of the University of Malta

**Michael O'FLAHERTY**, Director, European Union Agency for Fundamental rights

**François PAYCHÈRE**, Judge of the Geneva Court of Auditors (Suisse), former President of the CEPEJ-GT-QUAL

**Jean-Paul JEAN**, Honorary Chamber President at the Cour de cassation (France), Secretary General of the AHJUCAF (Supreme Judicial Courts of the Francophonie), former President of the CEPEJ-GT-QUAL (online)

**Georg STAWA**, Former President of the CEPEJ (2015 – 2018) and CEPEJ Member for Austria

## **OBSERVERS / OBSERVATEURS**

COUNCIL OF THE BARS AND LAW SOCIETIES OF THE EUROPEAN UNION / *CONSEIL DES BARREAUX EUROPEÉENS (CCBE)*

**James MACGUILL**, President

**Simone CUOMO**, Secretary General

EUROPEAN UNION OF RECHTSPFLEGER AND COURT CLERKS / *UNION EUROPÉENNE DES GREFFIERS DE JUSTICE (EUR)*

**Wolfgang LAEMMER**, Président (online)

**Jean-Jacques KUSTER**, Président honoraire de l'EUR, STRASBOURG, FRANCE (online)

EUROPEAN NETWORKS OF COUNCILS FOR THE JUDICIARY (ENCJ) / *RESEAU EUROPEEN DE CONSEILS DE LA JUSTICE (RECJ)*

**Monique VAN DER GOES** (online)

EUROPEAN ASSOCIATION OF JUDGES (AEM-EAJ) / *ASSOCIATION EUROPÉENNE DES MAGISTRATS (AEM-EAJ)*

**Giacomo OBERTO**, Magistrat, Tribunal de Grande Instance, TURIN, ITALIE

ASSOCIATION OF EUROPEAN ADMINISTRATIVE JUDGES (AEAJ) / *FEDERATION EUROPEENNE DES JUGES ADMINISTRATIFS (FEJA)*

**Sylvain MERENNE** (online)

EUROPEAN JUDICIAL TRAINING NETWORK (EJTN) / *RESEAU EUROPEEN DE FORMATION JUDICIAIRE (REFJ)*

**Quentin BALTHAZART**, Head of Office at the EJTN, BRUSSELS, BELGIUM (online)

EUROPEAN EXPERTISE AND EUROPEAN INSTITUTE (EEEI) / *INSTITUT EUROPEEN DE L'EXPERTISE ET DE L'EXPERT (EEEI)*

**Jean-Raymond LEMAIRE**, PARIS, France

**Nathalie SILLON**, PARIS, FRANCE

INTERNATIONAL UNION OF JUDICIAL OFFICERS / *UNION INTERNATIONALE DES HUISSIERS DE JUSTICE ET OFFICIERS JUDICIAIRES (UIHJ)*

**Marc SCHMITZ**, Président

**Mathieu CHARDON**, Secrétaire général, Huissier de justice, PARIS, FRANCE

OECD / *OCDE*

**Chloé LELIEVRE**, Programme Lead & Policy Analyst, Justice Services - Public Governance, PARIS, FRANCE

MEDEL

**Monika FRACKOWIAK**

**Bénédicte GIRARD (online)**

\*\*\*

**EUROPEAN UNION / UNION EUROPÉENNE**

*AGENCE DES DROITS FONDAMENTAUX DE L'UNION EUROPEENNE*

**Michael O'FLAHERTY**, Director

**Adrianna BOCHENEK**, Assistant to the Director

\*\*\*

**COUNCIL OF EUROPE / CONSEIL DE L'EUROPE**

CONSULTATIVE COUNCIL OF EUROPEAN PROSECUTORS / *CONSEIL CONSULTATIF DE PROCUREURS EUROPÉENS*(CCPE)

**Antonio VERCHER NOGUERA**, President of the Consultative Council of European Prosecutors (CCPE)

CONSULTATIVE COUNCIL OF EUROPEAN JUDGES / *CONSEIL CONSULTATIF DE JUGES EUROPÉENS* (CCJE)

**Duro SESSA**, President of the European Association of Judges and former President of the Consultative Council of European Judges (CCJE)

COMMITTEE ON ARTIFICIAL INTELLIGENCE / *COMITE SUR L'INTELLIGENCE ARTIFICIELLE* (CAI)

**Thomas SCHNEIDER**, Ambassador of Switzerland, President of the Committee on Artificial Intelligence (CAI) (online)

EUROPEAN COMMITTEE ON LEGAL CO-OPERATION / *COMITE EUROPÉEN DE COOPÉRATION JURIDIQUE* (CDCJ)

**João ARSENIO DE OLIVEIRA**, Head of Department, International Affairs Department, Directorate General for Justice Policy, Ministry of Justice, LISBON, PORTUGAL

**Marie DUGRE**, Magistrate, Cheffe du bureau de l'Europe et des questions institutionnelles, Ministère de la Justice, FRANCE (online)

**Livia STOICA-BECHT**, Secrétaire du CDCJ (online)

STEERING COMMITTEE FOR HUMAN RIGHTS/ *COMITÉ DIRECTEUR POUR LES DROITS DE L'HOMME*(CDDH)

**Vít Á. SCHORM**, Government Agent before the ECtHR Ministry of Justice, Vyšehradská 16, 128 10 PRAHA (online)

\*\*\*

**SECRETARIAT**

**DGI – Human Rights and Rule of Law – Division for the Independence and Efficiency of Justice**

***DGI - Droits de l'Homme et Etat de droit – Division pour l'indépendance et l'efficacité de la justice***

E-mail: [cepej@coe.int](mailto:cepej@coe.int)

**Frédéric DOLT**, Head of Department / Chef du Service

**Muriel DECOT**, Secretary of the CEPEJ / Secrétaire de la CEPEJ

**Christel SCHURRER**, Co-Secretary of the CEPEJ/ Co-Secrétaire de la CEPEJ

**Clemence BOUQUEMONT**, Co-Secretary of the CEPEJ/ Co-Secrétaire de la CEPEJ

**Lidija NAUMOVSKA**, Statistics coordinator

**Ioana VOELKEL**, Administrative assistant / Assistante administrative

**ONLINE :**

**Daniel SCHMIDT**, Administrator / Administrateur

**Eva KONECNA**, Administrator / Administratrice

**Milan NIKOLIC**, Administrator / Administrateur

**Federica VIAPIANA**, Administrator / Administratrice

**Guergana LAZAROVA-DECHAUX**, Evaluation Pole

**Tony VILELA**, Statisticien

**Daniela ZOL**, Statisticien

**Leonid ANTOHI**, Cooperation

**Roland GJONI**, Cooperation

**Jovana MATIC**, Cooperation

**Moritz TAYLOR**, Cooperation

**Anastasiia NOHOVITSYNA**, Cooperation

**Clémence FAURE**, Cooperation

**Iuliia TKACHENKO**, Assistant

**Sandrine LUTZ**, Assistant

**Sabina STANCU**, Trainee / Stagiaire

**Paul MEYER**, Cooperation (Rabat)

**Laurela MUCA**, Cooperation (Tirana)

**Sara RADOVICKA**, Cooperation assistant (Tirana)

**Emmanuel BARON**, Cooperation (Tunis)

**Fathia ABOUD**, Cooperation (Tunis)

**Narjes TIRA**, Cooperation (Tunis)

**Stéphanie LEFEUVRE**, Cooperation (Pristina)

**Stephanie LEFEUVRE**, Cooperation (Pristina)

**Njomza CARKAXHIU NUSHI**, Cooperation assistant (Pristina)

**Shabnam MIRZAYEVA**, Cooperation assistant (Baku)

**Aynur YUSIFOVA**, Cooperation (Baku)

**Domitille GAUTIER DE CHARNACE**, Cooperation (Tbilissi)

**Oxana GUTU**, Cooperation (Tbilisi)

**Tamar KATSITADZE**, Cooperation assistant (Tbilisi)

**BAKHTADZE Ushangi**, Cooperation (Tbilisi)

**Archil PASHALISHVILI**, Cooperation (Tbilisi)

**Ruslan GREBENCEA**, Cooperation (Chisinau)

**Tatiana TRIBOLO**, Cooperation (Chisinau)

\*\*\*

## INTERPRETERS / INTERPRÈTES

**Malta**

---

[1] CEPEJ(2021)16.

[2] CEPEJ (2005) 12 REV.

\* Cette désignation est sans préjudice des positions sur le statut et est conforme à la résolution 1244 du Conseil de sécurité des Nations unies, ainsi qu'à l'avis de la CIJ sur la Déclaration d'Indépendance du Kosovo.

[3] CEPEJ-COOP(2022)1

[4] CEPEJ(2022)5

[5] HELP: Human Rights Education for Legal Professionals.

[6] This designation is without prejudice to positions on status, and is in line with UNSCR 1244 and the ICJ Opinion on the Kosovo Declaration of Independence.